BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03328 4571

LABOUR ARBITRATION

READINGS, CASES AND MATERIALS

PREPARED BY KENNETH P. SWAN

WITH THE ASSISTANCE OF

JACQUIE DE AGUAYO

JANUARY 1996

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
JAN 17 1996
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

LABOUR ARBITRATION

READINGS, CASES AND MATERIALS

PREPARED BY KENNETH P. SWAN

WITH THE ASSISTANCE OF

JACQUIE DE AGUAYO

JANUARY 1996

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/labourarbitratio00swan

LABOUR ARBITRATION - READINGS, CASES AND MATERIALS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE - THE STATUTORY FRAMEWORK

A. Recent Statutory Developments

Kenneth P. Swan, "Legislative Reform of the Grievance Arbitration Process: A Tale of Two Provinces", in 1994-95 Labour Arbitration Yearbook, p. 3. 1

Labour Relations Act, 1995, ss. 48 - 50. 13

B. Models of Arbitration Procedures

Mark Thompson, "Expedited Arbitration: Promise and Performance", in 1992 Labour Arbitration Yearbook, p. 41. 17

CHAPTER TWO - ARBITRATORS

A. Impartiality, Neutrality and Independence

O.P.S.E.U. (Kowal) and Crown in Right of Ontario (Ministry of Health, G.S.B. File 813/88, December 21, 1989 (Verity). 24

Ontario Medical Association and The Province of Ontario, June 8, 1995, (Burkett). 39

Thomas S. Kuttner, "Bias and the Arbitral Forum", in 1991 Labour Arbitration Yearbook, Volume I, p. 23. 57

Re Miracle Food Mart, Steinberg Inc. and United Food & Commercial Workers Union, (1990) 18 L.A.C. (4th) 257 (Kennedy). 65

Re Ottawa General Hospital and C.U.P.E., Local 1657, (1994) 41 L.A.C. (4th) 344 (Dumoulin). 67

B. Bias and Social Context

Simmons v. Manitoba, [1982] 1 W.W.R. 140 (Man. Q.B.) 70

Judy Fudge, "Gender Issues in Arbitration: An Academic Perspective", in 1991 Labour Arbitration Yearbook, Volume I, p. 119. 75

Brian Bemmels, "Gender Effects in Arbitration", in 1991 Labour Arbitration Yearbook, Volume II, p. 167. 82

Clyde Scott and Elizabeth Shadoan, "The Effect of Gender on Arbitration Decisions", Journal of Labor Research, Volume X, Number 4 (Fall 1989), p.429. 88

CHAPTER THREE - THE ARBITRATION PROCESS

A. Whose Process?

Re Dartmouth General Hospital and C.B.R.T. & G.W.U., Local 606, (1981) 1 L.A.C. (3d) 444 (Langille). 93

B. Notice to other affected employees

Re Queen Elizabeth Hospital, Toronto and C.U.P.E., Local 1156, (1988) 2 L.A.C. (4th) 281 (Craven) 96

Re Orillia Soldiers' Memorial Hospital and Ontario Nurses' Association, (1993) 34 L.A.C. (4th) 314 (Swan) 102

Re John Noble Home and Ontario Nurses' Association, (1994) 39 L.A.C. (4th) 324 (Mitchnick) 115

C. Notice to third parties

Re Air Canada and Canadian Air Line Pilots Association, unreported, June 30, 1994 (Swan) 127

CHAPTER FOUR - ARBITRAL DISPUTE RESOLUTION

A. Evidentiary Issues

Re City of Toronto and C.U.P.E., Local 79, (1982) 133 D.L.R. (3d) 94 (Ont. C.A.); leave to appeal refused 36 O.R. (2d) 386n (S.C.C.) 139

B. Finding facts and weighing evidence

Re Air Canada and International Association of Machinists and Aerospace Workers (Beaulieu), (1994) 40 L.A.C. (4th) 80 (Bird) 146

C. Arbitral "doctrines"

Re Meadow Park Nursing Home and Service Employees International Union, Local 220 (1983), 9 L.A.C. (3d) 137 (Swan) 159

D. Mediating at arbitration

John Kagel, "Mediating Grievances" in Arbitration 1993; Proceedings of the 46th Annual Meeting of the National Academy of Arbitrators (Washington: B.N.A., 1994), p. 76. 165

CHAPTER FIVE - THE BOUNDARIES OF ARBITRAL AUTHORITY

A. The statutory obligation to arbitrate

Re Ontario Hydro and Ontario Hydro Employees' Union, Local 1000 (1983), 147 D.L.R. (3d) 210 (Ont. C.A.); leave to appeal refused 51 N.R. 155n (S.C.C.). 179

Weber v. Ontario Hydro (1995), 125 D.L.R. (4th) 583 (S.C.C.) 187

B. Collective agreement limitations

Re St. Joseph's Health Centre (London) and Ontario Nurses' Association, unreported, November 30, 1993 (M. G. Picher) 204

Isabelle v. O.P.S.E.U. (1981), 122 D.L.R. (3d) 385 (S.C.C.). 234

C. Judicial Review

Re Dayco (Canada) and National Automobile, Aerospace and Agriculture Implement Workers (1993), 102 D.L.R. (4th) 609 (S.C.C.) 239